



Live Coverage: Pope Francis travels to New York City »

**EQUIFAX** Get Equifax **3-Bureau Credit Scores** AdChoices  
**Only \$4.95** for your first month with Equifax Complete™ **START NOW**

Industries | Thu Sep 24, 2015 11:49am EDT

Related: FINANCIALS

# REFILE-SAFT ON WEALTH-CFOs see earnings shenanigans in 20 pct of U.S. public firms: James Saft

(Refiles to remove superfluous apostrophe from headline)

By [James Saft](#)

(Reuters) - If you think the fact that a U.S. company's earnings conform to accepted standards means they are to be trusted, then allow me to introduce you to the 20 percent of chief financial officers who disagree.

A survey of nearly 400 chief financial officers and top finance executives found the belief that earnings misrepresentation is widespread.

"CFOs believe that in any given period a remarkable 20 percent of firms intentionally distort earnings, even though they are adhering to generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP)," Ilia Dichev of Emory University, John Graham and Campbell Harvey of Duke University and Shiva Rajgopal of Emory and Columbia University write.

"The economic magnitude of the misrepresentation is large, averaging about 10 percent of reported earnings." ([here](#))

Think about that for a moment: a portfolio of 50 companies might include 10 which, though they are abiding by the letter of the regulations, are still giving a misleading view of their earnings and position.

Of the firms that do misrepresent earnings, two out of three overstate, with the remainder understating.

The survey polled 375 CFOs and others in equivalent positions, of whom a little less than half were at public companies. The authors also supplemented the data gathering with 12 anonymous, in-depth interviews with CFOs at large firms.

The CFO's themselves didn't give much credit to the existence or strength of an audit committee as a safeguard, giving them a low ranking in a listing of factors that influence earnings quality.

"I think you can fool them, but what the audit committee is essentially going to ask is whether the CEO and controller are basically honest people who are going to report faithfully," the report quoted one CFO as saying.

Time Warner Cable | ENJOY BETTER **ORDER NOW**

### TRENDING ON REUTERS

- [More than 700 pilgrims die in crush in worst haj disaster for 25 years](#) | VIDEO **1**
- [Senate stops bill defunding Planned Parenthood](#) **2**
- [IS suicide bomber dressed as a woman kills 10 at Yemen Houthi mosque](#) | VIDEO **3**
- [Exclusive: VW recall letters in April warned of an emissions glitch](#) **4**
- [Volkswagen to pick Porsche boss as new CEO: source](#) | VIDEO **5**

"That's about all they can do at the end of the day."

If audit committees don't strike fear in CFOs, neither do regulators. Even lower on the list, second last, was the enforcement process of the Securities and Exchange Commission.

CFO's gave even lower marks to privately held companies, estimating that earnings are misrepresented among them 30 percent of the time. That's a statistic that ought to alarm both private equity buyers of private companies and private equity investors.

In some ways that gap makes sense. Private companies face less scrutiny from public analysts and regulators, making the chances of being caught lower. Interestingly, CFOs, while not rating the ability of sell-side equity analysts to sniff out trouble, were more complimentary about debt investors and analysts, who usually pay closer attention to cash flows and less to flashy "growth" stories.

#### WHO STOLE THE COOKIE FROM THE COOKIE JAR?

We have a pretty clear view of why companies misreport earnings. They do so to impress Wall Street and drive their stock price. There is also internal pressure, either as a means of rigging executive compensation or because they feel they face sanction if they report poor performance.

Similar motivations may be behind understating earnings. Companies may wish to stash away what one CFO termed "cookie-jar reserves," funds that can be tapped later to flatter earnings if they fall short. It is also possible, but not supported by this data, that executives sometimes wish to create downward volatility in share prices as a means of maximizing the value of the share options they hold.

That company insiders benefit from and work to game incentives that are against the best interests of shareholders is not news. The sheer extent of this, though, if this survey is reliable, is shocking.

A practical question for investors is how to sift high-quality earnings from lower-quality ones.

There is an old expression "cash flows never lie" and CFOs appear to agree. When asked to name red flags for misrepresentation more than a third emphasized the importance of seeing earnings that don't correlate with cash flow from operations, or firms which show strong earnings despite falling cash flow.

As Enron and others have proved, another thing to look out for is a firm that never puts a foot wrong at earnings season, always meeting or beating analyst expectations. Large or frequent one-time or special items, like restructuring charges, can also flash red.

The upshot of all of this is more caution and due diligence by investors. Theoretically, this information will lead, or already has led, to investors demanding a higher risk premium in exchange for bearing accounting risk. Since we don't have a benchmark for this particular survey from before Sarbanes Oxley regulatory changes more than a decade ago, it is hard to know if the trend is for more fibbing or less.

Good or bad, earnings are read with a gimlet eye and taken with a large dose of salt. (At the time of publication James Saft did not own any direct investments in securities mentioned in this article. He may be an owner indirectly as an investor in a fund. You can email him at [jamessaft@jamessaft.com](mailto:jamessaft@jamessaft.com) and find more columns at [blogs.reuters.com/james-saft](https://blogs.reuters.com/james-saft)) (Editing by [James Dalgleish](#))



Watch your top stories

China's iFake 6S out before the real deal

ALSO | Caterpillar announces 10,00...

Your five minute news show of today's top stories

For more visit [Reuters.tv](https://www.reuters.com/tv)

#### Sponsored Financial Content



[Top 4 Credit Cards For Traveling](#) *NerdWallet*

[4 Ways to Avoid Running Out of Money in Retirement](#) *Fisher*

[Wipe Out Credit Card Interest Payments Within 5 Minutes By Doing This](#) *Next Advisor*

[What You Need To Know About Expanding Operations Abroad.](#) *BofAML*

["America's 25 Most Toxic Stocks" NAMES the stock you should drop today](#) *Money and Markets*

#### RECOMMENDED VIDEO

[Why RBS may pay small firms it allegedly ruined](#)

[Hundreds killed in Haj stampede](#)

[Carson calls for end to "PC culture"](#)

[Russia faces \\$12 billion asset freeze](#)

#### SPONSORED TOPICS

1. [Best Income Funds](#)
2. [Top Stock Picks](#)
3. [Penny Stocks to Invest In](#)
4. [Reverse Mortgage Calculator](#)
5. [2015 Best SUVs](#)
6. [Best Retirement Communities](#)

## More From Reuters

- [West Virginia engineer proves to be a David to VW's Goliath](#) | 22 Sep
- [Private equity firm Advent looking for more Brazil education deals](#) | 24 Sep
- [VW emissions rigging decision made before Winterkorn was CEO - minister](#) | 23 Sep
- [Factbox: Diesel engines and how VW's 'defeat device' worked](#) | 21 Sep
- [Diesel cars loiter in lots as VW dealers, owners sit and wait](#) | 22 Sep

## Sponsored Financial Content



- [Top 4 Credit Cards For Consolidating Your Debt](#) *NerdWallet*
- [7 Outrageous Credit Cards For Those Of Us That Have Excellent Credit](#) *Next Advisor*
- [4 Ways to Avoid Running Out of Money in Retirement](#) *Fisher*
- ["America's 25 Most Toxic Stocks" NAMES the stock you should drop today](#) *Money and Markets*
- [Pay Off Your Home With This Government Mortgage Relief Program](#) *Bills.com*

## From The Web

Sponsored Links by Taboola



[4 in 5 Americans Are Ignoring Buffett's Warning](#)  
*The Motley Fool*



[Luis Garmarra se adueñó de los corazones cuando interpretó...](#)  
*Univision*



[3 Banks Introduce New Cards Paying Unusually High Miles Pe...](#)  
*LendingTree*



[Jim Cramer's Brilliant Tip on Paying Off Mortgage](#)  
*Bills.com*



[New Grammar App Can Help You Succeed at Work](#)  
*Grammarly*



[Here's Why Transferring Your Credit Card Balance To a 15-...](#)  
*NextAdvisor*

## Sponsored Topics

1. [Best Income Funds](#)
2. [Top Stock Picks](#)
3. [Penny Stocks to Invest In](#)
4. [Top 10 4G LTE Cell Phones](#)
5. [5 Best Cars to Buy](#)
6. [2015 Best Smartphones](#)
7. [Best Credit Cards of 2015](#)
8. [Lowest Mortgage Rates](#)
9. [New Business Smartphones](#)
10. [Reverse Mortgage Calculator](#)

[Back to top](#)

[Reuters.com](#)

[More from Reuters](#)

[Support & Contact](#)

[Account Information](#)

[Connect with Reuters](#)

[Business](#) | [Markets](#) | [World](#) | [Politics](#) | [Technology](#) | [Opinion](#) | [Money](#) | [Pictures](#) | [Videos](#) | [Site Index](#)

[Reuters News Agency](#) | [Brand Attribution Guidelines](#) | [Delivery Options](#)

[Support](#) | [Corrections](#)

[Register](#) | [Sign In](#)

[Twitter](#)

[Facebook](#)

[LinkedIn](#)

[RSS](#)

[Podcast](#)

[Newsletters](#)

[Mobile](#)

---

Thomson Reuters is the world's leading source of intelligent information for businesses and professionals.

Our Flagship financial information platform incorporating Reuters Insider

An ultra-low latency infrastructure for electronic trading and data distribution

A connected approach to governance, risk and compliance

Our next generation legal research platform

Our global tax workstation

---

[Thomsonreuters.com](#)

---

[About Thomson Reuters](#)

---

[Investor Relations](#)

---

[Careers](#)

---

[Contact Us](#)

---

Thomson Reuters is the world's largest international multimedia news agency, providing investing news, world news, business news, technology news, headline news, small business news, news alerts, personal finance, stock market, and mutual funds information available on Reuters.com, video, mobile, and interactive television platforms. Thomson Reuters journalists are subject to an Editorial Handbook which requires fair presentation and disclosure of relevant interests.

NYSE and AMEX quotes delayed by at least 20 minutes. Nasdaq delayed by at least 15 minutes. For a complete list of exchanges and delays, please click here.